Summary Report

Neighbourhood Freight Forum Meeting #2

By Lindsay Wiginton | November 3, 2017

Location: EV Discovery Centre
1126 Finch Ave. W., Unit 1 Toronto, ON M3J 2T2

Date: Wednesday, October 18, 2017

Time: 8:00am – 10:30am

About

In 2016, in collaboration with the DUKE Heights BIA and with the financial support of The Atmospheric Fund, the Pembina Institute began a three-year pilot project to establish a Neighbourhood Freight Forum (NFF) in the DUKE Heights BIA, in northwest Toronto.

The goal of the NFF is to bring together local businesses and stakeholders, with the support of outside experts and policy makers, to identify and implement solutions to make shipping and deliveries more efficient in the BIA. Goods movement solutions can result in cost savings for businesses and reduced emissions. This NFF is the first neighbourhood-led freight forum in Canada. The project is not geared toward producing a study, but rather creating the conditions for solutions to be implemented.

Over the next three years, regular meetings and forums will be held to identify issues and advance solutions. On April 27, 2017, the kickoff NFF meeting was held. A second meeting was held on October 18, 2017. This document presents the results of this second meeting.

For more information about similar initiatives across the globe, please see: http://www.pembina.org/pub/improving-urban-freight-efficiency

For more information about the NFF, please contact Lindsay Wiginton at the Pembina Institute lindsayw@pembina.org | 647-478-9563 ext. 210 or see: http://www.pembina.org/freightforum
Objectives of the meeting

The objectives of the second NFF meeting were to:
- Provide project & neighbourhood updates
- Confirm problems identified at the first meeting
- Further develop 3-5 specific solutions for shipping and deliveries
- Identify next steps
- Recruit more local businesses to the NFF

Agenda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8:00</td>
<td>Registration, breakfast and networking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8:15</td>
<td>Opening remarks, agenda and introductions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8:20</td>
<td>Project updates and recap</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8:40</td>
<td>Guest presentations – examples to inspire action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Darryl Brown, The Drop: Delivery consolidation in North York</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Michael Brewer, MTO: Green Commercial Vehicle program; Off-peak delivery pilot for Pan-Am Games</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:10</td>
<td>Designing potential solutions (breakout groups)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Proposed topics:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Changing how deliveries are done</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Off-peak delivery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Consolidated deliveries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Support for businesses to green their fleets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Sharing the road between trucks &amp; other modes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:50</td>
<td>Group presentations &amp; discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30</td>
<td>Adjourn</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The NFF meeting was facilitated by the staff at the Pembina Institute, with support from the staff at the DUKE Heights BIA. The PowerPoint presentation from the meeting is available at http://www.pembina.org/freightforum.
Invitations and promotion

A significant outreach effort was undertaken by the project team to encourage participation, including:

DUKE Heights BIA:
- Email invitation to a long list of businesses (2,000 businesses/2,500 individuals)
- Paper flyer distributed to businesses across the BIA (2,500 businesses)
- Direct calls by the Executive Director to key businesses (approximately 20 calls)
- Email reminder to registrants two days before the event
- Social media (Twitter and Facebook) promotion

Pembina Institute:
- Personalized emails and direct calls to participants and registrants from NFF Meeting #1
- Personalized emails and direct calls to new local stakeholders identified by participants at NFF Meeting #1 (approximately 12 stakeholders)
- Direct calls to local businesses who had not yet participated with permission from DUKE Heights BIA (approximately 50 calls)
- Updates on the project microsite (https://www.pembina.org/freightforum) and the Pembina Institute events page (https://www.pembina.org/event/neighbourhood-freight-forum-2)

External:
- Promotion on the Ontario Trucking Association website (http://ontruck.org/neighbourhood-freight-forum/)

Please see Annex 1 for examples of promotional materials used.
Participation

27 people participated in the NFF, representing a wide range of stakeholders, including representatives from:

- Businesses
- Delivery companies
- Information technology companies
- York University
- The local municipal councillor’s office
- City and provincial government staff
- Members of the Project Advisory Group

Participants at the second meeting of the NFF discuss and develop potential solutions.

1 The Project Advisory Group (PAG) is made up of members from the Pembina Institute (chair), DUKE Heights BIA, The Atmospheric Fund (funder), City of Toronto, Metrolinx, Ontario Ministry of Transportation, Ontario Trucking Association, Canadian Fuels Association, the University of Toronto and the Region of Peel.
What we heard

Problems

We presented a summary of the problems we heard in the first meeting and asked participants if they had anything to add or clarify. The summary of goods movement issue in the DUKE Heights BIA was:

- Congestion
  - Traffic volume
  - Intersection size
  - Traffic light timing
  - Concentration of demand at morning and afternoon peaks
  - Lack of north-south and east-west road connectivity
- Major construction
- Illegal parking
- Interaction between trucks and other transportation modes
- Lack of data

Participants did not have anything to add to this list. However, it is worth noting that there was a greater share of regional actors at this second meeting (as opposed to local businesses stakeholders), so participants may not have felt fully informed on local issues.

Solutions

The focus of this meeting was to build on the ideas that emerged in the first meeting to develop 3-5 tangible solutions that could be pursued in the DUKE Heights BIA and/or a wider region to make goods movement more efficient for local businesses. We noted that solutions could fall under one of three categories: business-led, city-led, or leveraging existing programs.

Three guest presentations helped to illustrate solutions that could be adapted applied in the DUKE Heights neighbourhood:

- Michael Brewer from the Ministry of Transportation presented information about the Modernized Green Commercial Vehicles (GCV) Program. This forthcoming program of the Ontario government offers rebates to qualifying companies aiming to adopt alternative fuel-powered trucks (including electric, natural gas and dual fuel), aerodynamics retrofits, anti-idling devices, and electric trailer refrigeration. Initially launched in 2007, the program will be re-launched in the coming months as part of the province’s Climate Change Action Plan.
- Michael Brewer from the Ministry of Transportation presented highlights from the off-peak delivery pilot established to reduce congestion during the 2015 Pan Am and Parapan Am Games. Over 100 retail, food, and grocery businesses participated in this pilot which resulted in 18,400 deliveries diverted during the Games.

---

• Darryl Brown from The Drop Distribution talked about The Drop’s business model, which delivers food products from small producers to retailers across parts of the GTA by cargo bike and electric vehicles. A key component of The Drop’s approach is a delivery consolidation centre in North York.

Next, we asked participants to examine solutions that could apply in the DUKE Heights BIA and to further develop these ideas. Participants could choose from three solutions areas:

1. Changing how deliveries are done (e.g. off-peak delivery, delivery consolidation, etc.)
2. Support for businesses to green their fleets (e.g. access to programs and information)
3. Sharing the road between trucks and other modes (e.g. planning solutions)

Participants were asked to consider:

• Solution design
• What type of local businesses does the solution apply to?
• Who will benefit?
• Who will need to be involved to make it happen?
• What might get in the way of success?
• Could your solution be applied beyond the DUKE Heights BIA?

The results of each working group are summarized below. These do not represent final solutions, but rather concepts and ideas that can be explored further with targeted businesses and stakeholders.

**Changing how deliveries are done**

• Solution: Shifting transportation demand
• Solution description:
  o Consideration: 2/3 of vehicles pass through the neighbourhood
  o Further data needed: origin/destination of deliveries, types of deliveries, types of vehicles, which businesses are open at night.
  o A change in mindset from businesses on when to expect deliveries and benefits of changing approach.
  o A change in working hours of businesses (i.e. move away from 8 a.m.-4 p.m.). Most of the traffic is passenger vehicles — by changing employment patterns there will be spillover effects on goods movement.
  o Could consolidate Purolator and Canada Post deliveries.
  o Note: Off-peak doesn’t mean the same thing everywhere.
• Solution applies to: the Loblaws at the intersection of Dufferin Street and Steeles Avenue West has night crew delivery. Exclude businesses near residential areas.
• Who will benefit: companies can save on costs.
• Who needs to be involved: need data to understand progress, monitor performance and adjust solution; need buy-in from businesses to change work hours (select those that can stay after hours); need incentives to change office hours (for example to 11 a.m.-7 p.m.).
What might get in the way of success: there is no one-size-fits-all solution for delivery consolidation. Success will depend on our ability to engage with different segments of the business community. Competition among businesses/carriers is also a barrier.

Scale: no comment on whether the solution is applicable beyond the DUKE Heights BIA.

**Support for businesses to green their fleets**

Solution: Support for businesses to green their fleets: expanding access to programs and information

Solution description:
- Context: the government has programs to support initiatives and innovations to support commercial vehicles shifting to electric vehicles.
- Consider: dedicated parking spots for greener fleets (including bicycles) with a permit or pay for use system (less than parking ticket).
- Consider: retrofits to existing infrastructure such as alternative fuelling/charging stations. Fueling stations are currently in parking lots that aren’t accessible.
- Increase education and awareness for government programs to local businesses.

Solution applies to: any businesses receiving deliveries.

Who will benefit: local businesses through improved safety, infrastructure, traffic flow; delivery companies (by receiving less parking tickets).

Who needs to be involved: DUKE Heights BIA, delivery companies (such as Canada Post, UPS, FedEx, Purolator, The Drop, etc.), the City of Toronto.

What might get in the way of success: site plan evaluations and permits may not allow these solutions under current regulations.

Scale: other BIAs could pursue this approach.

Other regional solutions identified:
- Create a testing site for technologies
- Offer certification for green commercial products
- Install operations, maintenance and service facilities for electric, propane, LNG, and CNG commercial trucks
- Ensure that when municipalities or others are installing charging stations, they consider infrastructure to support commercial vehicles, not just personal vehicles.

**Sharing the road between trucks and other modes**

Solution title: Repurposing bus lanes

Solution description (see figure below):
- Context: changing dynamics, new transit routes, improvements underway on Transit Road.
- Consider: improved signalization, street widening and intersection treatment, addition of queuing lanes, lengthening turning lanes, doubling turning lane at the Sheppard Avenue West and Allen Road intersection.
- Change the use of the York University busway. Allow freight and other high volume vehicles, add new signage.
- Change the use of the HOV bus lane on Dufferin Street to a shared lane or truck-only lane.
- Add bus bays, for example on Sheppard Avenue West, east of the rail line.
• Solution applies to: any local businesses relying on freight, particularly businesses in the northern half of the BIA or along Finch Avenue West, including the fuels terminal.
• Who will benefit: road users in the area including the general public and commuters.
• Who needs to be involved: to clarify options for the HOV lane, the City of Toronto and TTC would need to be involved. Other stakeholders include CN, Metrolinx, Hydro One and utilities.
• What might get in the way of success: crossing the CN rail corridor (dangerous goods usually pass underneath via tunnels), jurisdictional issues and difficulty of reaching agreements/cooperation, engineering challenges.
• Scale: since this solution is focused on the neighbourhood, it is not immediately applicable beyond the DUKE Heights BIA.
Visual concept plan from the group that developed a solution for sharing the road between trucks and other users.
Participant feedback

Participants were asked to fill out comment cards. 13 participants filled out the “Your comments on the meeting” section. The results show a high degree of satisfaction with the event.

Six participants filled out the “Staying involved” section. The results illustrate the interest in the project, but also the challenges to implementing solutions and the need for local businesses to be at the table.

Results from the comment cards
In their written comments about the meeting, participants mentioned the following:

- Appreciation for the mix of participants
- Concern that more local businesses need to be present
- Participants found the session useful for understanding local issues and solutions and appreciated hearing from others with similar challenges
- Suggestion for more time for group discussion on solutions
- There is interest on the part of businesses that sell solutions to build or support catered solutions
- There is a feeling that there is a lot of potential for sharing across municipalities and the region
- There is excitement about participating in future solution-oriented discussions

**Next steps**

The Pembina Institute and project partners will be reviewing the results of this meeting, ongoing research and data collection to set a strategy for next steps which will involve pursuing specific conversations, pilots and solutions and continued outreach to businesses.

The Pembina Institute will communicate next steps via email with participating businesses and stakeholders. Project updates can also be found on the project website at: https://www.pembina.org/freightforum

The work of the NFF will continue to be supported by the Project Advisory Group, a group of experts that provide advice and input into the NFF process.
Annex 1: Promotional materials

Invitation email:

Does your business ship or receive goods? Do you think there are ways to improve trucking in the neighbourhood? Can you help improve freight efficiency and and reduce emissions?

Join us at the next meeting of the Neighbourhood Freight Forum to share your ideas.

Wednesday, 18 October 2017, 8:00 AM – 10:30 AM
Location: EV Discovery Centre, 1126 Finch Avenue West, Unit 1
Breakfast will be included. All local businesses are encouraged to attend.

To RSVP, click here: https://nff2.eventbrite.ca

The DUKE Heights BIA is partnering with the Pembina Institute to launch this initiative, which will bring together businesses to find solutions that could help reduce gridlock, improve delivery reliability and reduce fuel use. To find out more, go to: http://www.pembina.org/freightforum
Sample tweet:

The next #NeighbourhoodFreightForum is happening one week from now! October 18th at 1126 Finch W, unit 1. RSVP: nff2.eventbrite.ca

Does your business ship or receive goods? Do you think there are ways to improve trucking in the neighbourhood? Can you help improve freight efficiency and reduce emissions?

Join us at the next meeting of the Neighbourhood Freight Forum to share your ideas.

Wednesday, 18 October 2017, 8:00 AM – 10:30 AM
Location: EV Discovery Centre, 1126 Finch Avenue West, Unit 1
Breakfast will be included.
All local businesses are encouraged to attend.